Devens Economic Analysis Team ("DEAT")

Minutes of July 27, 2011 Meeting
7:00 pm – 9:00pm
Hildreth House, Dining Room

Orville Dodson, Clerk

Members Present: Victor Normand, Sandy Chapman, Paul Green, Orville Dodson, Steve Finnegan, Steve Colwell, Maureen Babcock.

Victor Normand called the meeting to order at 7:00pm.

We first reviewed the minutes of the prior meeting (7/15/11). It was moved and seconded that we accept and approve the minutes for 7/15/11 and the vote was unanimous to approve.

A large portion of the meeting was devoted to the presentation of reports by five members (Steve Finnegan, Steve Colwell, Sandy, Paul, Victor) on research each did since our 7/15 meeting.

Steve Finnegan was the first to present his report. He had studied school-age children numbers. He talked with the researchers at NESDEC who recommended knocking out the 1-BR units in a project and looking only at the 2 and 3-BR units as contributors to school-age children. Taking four completed Trinity projects and looking at the known number of school-age children in each and the number of 2 and 3-BR units in them, he got between 1.1 and 1.29 school-age children per 2 or 3BR unit. Vicksburg Square has 122 2 and 3BR units so one gets the number of 134 to 157 school-age children from them. Thus Trinity's estimated number of school-age children from Vicksburg seems to be a good number. Victor asked Steve to write a paragraph for our preliminary Vicksburg report on education/children and asked Maureen if she could look at the effect of Vicksburg's children upon Harvard Schools were Harvard take back the land at Vicksburg.

Steve Colwell reported next. He had looked at Harvard town employee wages and how many would qualify for affordable units at Vicksburg. He first listed the income limits for affordable units at Vicksburg:

- Single person $15,703 – 38,580
- Couple $15,703 – 44,100
- Family of Three $18,103 – 49,620
- Family of Four $18,103 – 55,080

He then presented members with three tables, one for Teachers, one for Police, and one for non-union town employees. They are Figures 1-3 at the end of these minutes. Each table presents the range of salaries for Teachers, Police, and non-union. On each Steve marked where in each table the earnings level began to exceed each Vicksburg affordable unit limit (Single, Couple, Family of 3, and Family of 4). He was unable to get earnings data for DPW and Dispatch since union negotiations are currently underway. Broadly speaking, it looks like a large majority of current Harvard Teachers would not qualify for affordables. Steve will get the actual number of current Harvard Teachers in each cell of the Teachers earnings matrix (Figure 1) to get the precise number of Teachers that could qualify. Victor

asked if Maureen could get the profile of a typical teacher new-hire including the starting salary of the last 10 new teachers hired. At Police, no Singles would quality, nor any Sergeants. Of the 8 current Police in Harvard, only 1 would qualify. In non-union, there is some opportunity for town employees to qualify. Of the current 128 non-union employees, 27 would qualify. Victor asked Steve to get a profile of the last 5-10 non-union new-hires.

Sandy Duncan next reported upon wage information for civilian, federal, and military jobs at Devens. He was unable to get much information thusfar because of people on summer vacations. Victor mentioned that Kathleen O'Connor at Mass Dev might have some wage information at Devens. Also Mt. Wachusett Community College might have some knowledge of civilian workforce wages. The Housing Officer at Hanscomb Air Base might be able to help on military wages and housing and likewise the same at Devens if Devens has one. Sandy will pursue Hanscomb and Housing Officers for information.

Paul then reported upon demographics and housing projects in our area. He used data from masshousing.com. He took the 7 towns that border Harvard and those that border them to get 19 towns. He looked at all housing projects within those towns. Only half the towns had any. There were 22 projects in 11 town and they appear in Figure 4 at the end of these minutes. Paul observed that the percent of elderly units at Vicksburg is in line with the average for the 22 observed projects. Vicksburg is very large, only one of the 22 projects has more units (Riverside Village in Leominster). Paul suggested several areas for further study at each of the 22 projects:

- Are there veterans preferences?
- What the rents are.
- What percent are affordable, what percent market-rate.
- What percent of median income qualifies as affordable?

Victor had some additional questions to study. Do any of the projects use "60% of median income" affordability tax credits? A general consensus is that mixed housing is a good idea and that 25% affordable is about the upper limit on affordables that will work and be successful. Which of the 22 projects are mixed housing and what is the affordable percentage in each. Vicksburg's affordable percent is 80 which is quite high.

Finally, Victor reported on his investigation of tax revenues that Vicksburg might produce. He talked with the current assessor at Devens and Trinity's estimate of $208,000 per year of tax revenue from Vicksburg is a solid and good number – it is based on the "income" method of taxation. So Trinity's plan of all rental and 80% affordable at Vicksburg will produce close to the estimated $208,000 per year in tax revenue. Victor then looked 3 different options at Vicksburg: All Rental 25% affordable, All Ownership (no rental) 25% affordable, and 25% Rental 25% Affordable. He got an estimated annual tax revenue for each of these 3 options of $464,833, $1,122,083, and $1,071,019, respectively. He also estimated Disposable Income for Trinity's plan and for the 3 options. He got (in $ millions) 12 (Trinity's plan), 17, 51, 47 (for options 1,2,3). Bottom line is that tax revenue and disposable income rise as the amount of market-rate and the amount of Ownership increase. The purpose of Victor's analysis is to present several other scenarios by which Vicksburg might be done.

This concluded the reports. Victor reported that Dan Drazen from Trinity would like to meet with the DEAT, probably to go over Trinity's answers to some of our questions to them. The Board of Selectmen wants to meet with us in late August. Since a preliminary report might be due by the end of

August, it was decided to add at least one additional DEAT meeting to our schedule. We will have an additional meeting on Friday, August 5.

It was then moved and seconded that the meeting adjourn. The vote was unanimous to adjourn and we did so at about 9pm.

FY12   FY11 Salary Scale, add 1% COLA

No Singles   C o l u m n s

Steps	B	B15	M	M15	M30	M45	M60	PhD
1	42,156	43,648	45,256	46,374	47,886	49,392	50,422	51,375
2	43,700	45,374	47,264	48,693	50,425	52,153	53,240	54,249
3	45,244	47,100	49,271	51,014	52,965	54,914	56,060	57,124
4	46,786	48,826	51,279	53,333	55,503	57,673	58,879	59,997
5	48,531	50,762	53,509	55,885	58,288	60,687	61,957	63,135
6	50,084	52,496	55,524	58,215	60,838	63,458	64,787	66,020
7	51,633	54,229	57,540	60,544	63,388	66,230	67,619	68,905
8	53,182	55,962	59,557	62,873	65,940	69,002	70,450	71,792
9	55,660	58,676	62,615	66,313	69,660	73,001	74,533	75,954
10	57,236	60,441	64,666	68,685	72,255	75,820	77,414	78,890
11	58,814	62,204	66,717	71,053	74,850	78,641	80,293	81,825
12	60,396	63,963	68,772	73,430	77,448	81,458	83,170	84,757
13	61,974	65,727	70,822	75,800	80,044	84,278	86,051	87,695

Couple

family of 3

Family of 4

Over Max.

To be eligible for the Doctorate Column teachers must have obtained a

Figure 1: Town of Harvard School Dept Teachers Salaries

No Sings *Police Dept.*

Section 1: Police Officer
Effective July 1, 2010, the salary rates for regular full-time officers will be as follows:

*Academy Untrained	Academy Trained	1 Yr. Employ.	2 Yrs. Employ.	3 Yrs. Employ.	4 Yrs. Employ.
$18.60	$20.23	$20.57	$21.82	$23.39	$25.22

Section 1: Police Officer
Effective July 1, 2011, the salary rates for regular full-time officers will be as follows
(This year is subject to a re-opener clause found in Article XXV, Duration of Agreement.):

Couple *family of 3* *Family of 4*

*Academy Untrained	Academy Trained	1 Yr. Employ.	2 Yrs. Employ.	3 Yrs. Employ.	4 Yrs. Employ.
$18.60	$20.23	$20.57	$21.82	$23.39	$25.22
38,831	42,240	42,950	45,560	48,838	52,659

At 2,088 hours

Section 1: Police Officer
Effective July 1, 2012, the salary rates for regular full-time officers will be as follows
(This year is subject to a re-opener clause found in Article XXV, Duration of Agreement.):

*Academy Untrained	Academy Trained	1 Yr. Employ.	2 Yrs. Employ.	3 Yrs. Employ.	4 Yrs. Employ.
$18.60	$20.23	$20.57	$21.82	$23.39	$25.22

Section 2: Police Sergeant
Effective July 1, 2010, the salary rate for regular full-time police sergeants will be 115% of a 4yr. employee, which equals $29.00

Effective July 1, 2011, the salary rate for regular full-time police sergeants will be 115% of a 4yr. employee, which equals $29.00 (This year is subject to a re-opener clause found in Article XXV, Duration of Agreement.) *60,552* *Over max.*

At 2,088 hours

Effective July 1, 2012, the salary rate for regular full-time police sergeants will be 115% of a 4yr. employee, which equals $29.00 (This year is subject to a re-opener clause found in Article XXV, Duration of Agreement.)

*As per Massachusetts General Laws C.41, S.96B. — *also ALL Harvard are academ train...*

Figure 2: Town of Harvard Police Dept Salaries

All Other (non-union) (handwritten)

Grade/Step	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
I	$ 10.25	$ 10.48	$ 10.72	$ 10.96	$ 11.20	$ 11.46	$ 11.71	$ 11.98	$ 12.26	$ 12.52
II	$ 11.70	$ 11.97	$ 12.24	$ 12.51	$ 12.79	$ 13.08	$ 13.38	$ 13.68	$ 13.98	$ 14.30
III	$ 13.36	$ 13.67	$ 13.97	$ 14.29	$ 14.61	$ 14.94	$ 15.27	$ 15.62	$ 15.97	$ 16.33
IV	$ 15.26	$ 15.61	$ 15.96	$ 16.32	$ 16.68	$ 17.06	$ 17.44	$ 17.83	$ 18.24	$ 18.65
V	$ 17.05	$ 17.43	$ 17.82	$ 18.22	$ 18.63	$ 19.05	$ 19.48	$ 19.92	$ 20.37	$ 20.83
VI	$ 19.47	$ 19.91	$ 20.36	$ 20.82	$ 21.28	$ 21.76	$ 22.25	$ 22.75	$ 23.27	$ 23.79
VII	$ 22.24	$ 22.74	$ 23.25	$ 23.78	$ 24.31	$ 24.86	$ 25.42	$ 25.99	$ 26.58	$ 27.17
VIII	$ 25.41	$ 25.98	$ 26.56	$ 27.16	$ 27.77	$ 28.40	$ 29.04	$ 29.69	$ 30.36	$ 31.04
IX	$ 28.39	$ 29.03	$ 29.68	$ 30.35	$ 31.03	$ 31.73	$ 32.44	$ 33.17	$ 33.92	$ 34.68
X	$ 31.72	$ 32.43	$ 33.16	$ 33.91	$ 34.67	$ 35.45	$ 36.25	$ 37.06	$ 37.90	$ 38.75
XI	$ 36.24	$ 37.05	$ 37.88	$ 38.74	$ 39.61	$ 40.50	$ 41.41	$ 42.34	$ 43.30	$ 44.27
XII	$ 41.40	$ 42.33	$ 43.28	$ 44.26	$ 45.25	$ 46.27	$ 47.31	$ 48.38	$ 49.47	$ 50.58
XIII	$ 47.30	$ 48.37	$ 49.45	$ 50.57	$ 51.71	$ 52.87	$ 54.06	$ 55.27	$ 56.52	$ 57.79

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
I	$ 21,322	$ 21,801	$ 22,292	$ 22,793	$ 23,306	$ 23,831	$ 24,367	$ 24,915	$ 25,476	$ 26,049
II	$ 24,344	$ 24,892	$ 25,452	$ 26,025	$ 26,610	$ 27,209	$ 27,821	$ 28,447	$ 29,087	$ 29,742
III	$ 27,798	$ 28,424	$ 29,063	$ 29,717	$ 30,386	$ 31,070	$ 31,769	$ 32,484	$ 33,215	$ 33,962
IV	$ 31,746	$ 32,460	$ 33,191	$ 33,938	$ 34,701	$ 35,482	$ 36,280	$ 37,097	$ 37,931	$ 38,785
V	$ 35,459	$ 36,257	$ 37,073	$ 37,907	$ 38,760	$ 39,632	$ 40,524	$ 41,436	$ 42,368	$ 43,321
VI	$ 40,501	$ 41,413	$ 42,344	$ 43,297	$ 44,271	$ 45,267	$ 46,286	$ 47,327	$ 48,392	$ 49,481
VII	$ 46,263	$ 47,304	$ 48,369	$ 49,457	$ 50,570	$ 51,707	$ 52,871	$ 54,060	$ 55,277	$ 56,521
VIII	$ 52,848	$ 54,037	$ 55,253	$ 56,496	$ 57,768	$ 59,067	$ 60,396	$ 61,755	$ 63,145	$ 64,565
IX	$ 59,045	$ 60,373	$ 61,732	$ 63,121	$ 64,541	$ 65,993	$ 67,478	$ 68,996	$ 70,548	$ 72,136
X	$ 65,970	$ 67,455	$ 68,972	$ 70,524	$ 72,111	$ 73,733	$ 75,392	$ 77,089	$ 78,823	$ 80,597
XI	$ 75,370	$ 77,066	$ 78,800	$ 80,573	$ 82,386	$ 84,239	$ 86,135	$ 88,073	$ 90,054	$ 92,080
XII	$ 86,112	$ 88,050	$ 90,031	$ 92,056	$ 94,128	$ 96,245	$ 98,411	$ 100,625	$ 102,889	$ 105,204
XIII	$ 98,388	$ 100,602	$ 102,866	$ 105,180	$ 107,547	$ 109,966	$ 112,441	$ 114,971	$ 117,557	$ 120,203

(handwritten margin notes: "Singles", "Couple", "am. 3", "am. 4", "Over Max")

Figure 3: Town of Harvard Non-union Salaries

Town	Project Name	Street Address	Site Telephone	PB Subsidy	MH Financed	Family Units	Elderly Units	0-1 BR	2-3 BR	4+ BR	Accessible
Berlin	Northbrook Village	135 Pleasant St	(978) 838-2089	yes		40	0	36	4	0	4
Chemsford	Meadows at Brick Kiln	82 Brick Kiln Rd	(978) 441-9167		yes	180	0	60	120	0	9
Chemsford	Princeton Commons	1 Technology Dr	(978) 323-7800		yes	108	0	36	72	0	0
Clinton	Oxford House	182 Church St			yes	108	0	23	85	0	6
Clinton	Prescott Mill	24 Water St		yes	yes	8	93	79	22	0	11
Groton	Groton Commons	74 Willowdale St		yes		0	34	34	0	0	4
Hudson	Littlebrook	100 Tower St			yes	96	0	8	88	0	4
Hudson	Machado House	11 Lake St		yes	yes	9	87	86	10	0	9
Leominster	Litchfield Terrace	42 Terrace Dr		yes	yes	216	0	42	174	0	1
Leominster	Riverside Village	1 State St		yes	yes	312	0	78	234	0	1
Leominster	Waterway Apts	106 Water St		yes	yes	16	73	64	25	0	8
Leominster	Whitney Carriage Pk	124 Water St			yes	181	0	18	163	0	12
Littleton	Millpond Apts	50 Mill Rd		yes	yes	0	50	50	0	0	4
Littleton	Minuteman Housing	500 Newtown Rd		yes		8	0	8	0	0	8
Littleton	Pondside at Littleton	147 King St			yes	90	0	7	83	0	5
Maynard	Old Mill Glen	438 Dawn Rd		yes	yes	50	0	18	32	0	4
Maynard	Summer Hill Glen	121 Summer Hill Glen		yes	yes	0	120	72	48	0	13
Stow	Pilot Grove Hill	11 Warren Rd			yes	60	0	12	48	0	3
Stow	Plantation Apts	1 Johnston Way		yes		0	50	48	2	0	6
Sudbury	Longfellow Glen	655 Boston Post Rd		yes	yes	70	50	50	70	0	9
Sudbury	Orchard Hill	761 Boston Post Rd			yes	0	45	45	0	0	2
Townsend	Townsend Elderly	66 Dudley Rd		yes		0	50	50	0	0	5
TOTALS						1552 +	652	924	1280	0	128
Total Units						2204					
Percents						70%	30%	42%	58%	0%	6%
Devens	Hale					0	78	47	31	0 ?	TOTALS 78
	Knox					44	0	22	26	0	48

Figure 4: Projects in Nearby Towns